MEDIA DISCOURSE ANALYSIS ON PROFEMINISM ISSUE OF INDOONESIAN FAMILY PLANNING AND HEALTH REPRODUCTIVE PROGRAMS

Tuti Widiastuti
Communication Department, Bakrie University
tuti.widiastuti@bakrie.ac.id

Abstract - The core of study being conducted is the text within public service advertising in which depicts the idea of profeminism in media. According to the intertextuality analysis derived by the social construction of reality theory by Berger and Luckmann, as well as the hegemony theory by Gramsci in which became the theoretical framework, both of which are utilized to integrate three level analytical framework model by Fairclough. Based on that fact, this type of study lies under the research method of ‘single case multilevel analyses. The reason for selecting framing analysis approach from Pan and Kosicki on the text level is because the meaning and value of profeminism in public service advertising of Indonesia family planning and health reproduction programs could produce interesting discourses if analyzed from the angle of communication and social reality construction in media. The finding of data proved that the symbolic reality for profeminism being constructed through public service advertising of Indonesia family planning and healthy reproduction programs only has the artificial nature. The symbolic reality only enhances and perpetuates the gender bias in the patriarchal society. So it can be concluded that there is a distortion in the meaning and value of the public service advertising profeminism in family planning and health reproductive programs.

Keywords: social construction of reality, profeminism, family planning and reproductive health

INTRODUCTION

Women, according to many who have the concern with the women development issues claim that they have a lot to catch up in positioning them equally as men in many aspects of life. In the attempts of catching up, many ideas and concepts have established, starting from ‘emancipation’ between men and women in the 1950s and 1960s. In the year of 1975 in Mexico City, the United Nations held an event called World Conference International Year of Woman, where they produced a declaration of equality between men and women. In the moment of declaration, many developments took place in women empowerment programs. To facilitate those activities, the theme, Women in development (shortened to WID) were introduced. This WID program stresses on the quantity approach in improving women empowerment.

Looking back to those ten years (1970-1980), the WID programs turned out to not be satisfactory, as a result of the lacking in cooperation with men. The dichotomy approach were felt to leave little result, and even worst, triggered the male backlash from men towards women efforts. In relation to that and complemented with the study result in the field, the WID approach was altered becoming ‘Women and Development or WAD. The word ‘within’ was changed with ‘and’ which means ‘involvement’, or in other words giving meaning that the women equality quality in development was more essential than only quantity.

In the year 1990 in Vienna, the 34th Commission on Status of Women was held. In here, the concept of not involving men in the women empowerment still occurred. Anderson Study (1992) and Moser (1993) offered recommendation that without compliance, cooperation, and involvement with men, the women empowerment programs would not flourish. Therefore, entering the mid 1990s, the gender approach in development programs or familiarly referred to “Gender and Development or GAD was used. In the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD) in Kairo 1994 and...
in 4th World Conference on Women in Beijing 1995, those conferences resulted in a variety of operational commitments regarding status improvement and women role for development, starting from formulating policies stage, execution and until enjoying the results of the very development. This shift in paradigm has made Indonesia do the same, improving status and admitting the role of women in development by focusing in development programs through “Pengarusutamaan Gender or Gender Mainstreaming(PUG)”. The campaign on PUG in essence was a strategy performed to create equality and fairness in gender. PUG was also applied in family planning and health reproduction programs in Indonesia.

According to the research and writings on family planning and healthy reproduction programs throughout time, there have been many approaches. There have been many research that stressed on the health, social and culture, as well as economic issues in family planning (Mantra, 1994; Suprihastuti, 2000; Pangkahila, 2000; LDFE UI, 1998; Kollmann, 1997; Pramono, 2017). The other researches that criticized the program were criticized that reproduction health should not only be a woman’s responsibility(SitaAripurnami, 1999; Handayani&Sugiarti, 2002). The government regulation to limit and solve the growth rate of population was considered to violate women’s reproduction right. Women were becoming the main target of family planning program due to the fact that biologically, women were thought to have low productivity, and the work around the house did not have economical value, therefore they had to be empowered and be involved in development programs to reach emancipation. So the role of men in the health quality increment had to take place. Furthermore, the development programs in which include family planning and healthy reproduction programs were expected to provide a place and opportunity for women to be active in the public sphere.

Relating to the fair and equal gender movement, and all other things developing within, this research analyzes those public service ads into one of ‘media discourse analysis’, in which is considered to be a multilevel analysis, in line with what Norman Fairclough said. The social event that would be observed is the symbolic reality in media which is believed to be the portrayal of objective reality happening in society. According to Berger and Luckmann, our comprehension and understanding rise as a result of the social construction in particular community(Littlejohn, 2002: 163). Meaning, the symbolic reality regarding the portrayal of profeminism in public service ads of family planning and healthy reproduction by BKKBN, is actually not linear-based align with objective reality in everyday phenomena within society. Because the truth is, that every text production would not be as simple as delivering any story, but also include the process of sharing experiences among the people involved in the media text production.

The perpetual strong influence of mass media cannot be far from the media extras which often influence it (Reese & Shoemaker, 1996: 175-220). Every message production that would be sent to the mass may have had already been disdained and formatted based on production texts practices, where are also influenced by many external factors such as social culture practices. The extra media influence has a contribution to text production, because mass media on one side act as the mediator in spreading the message to supporters or media clients. However, on another side, media act as the mediator to the people who attempt to fulfill the need of information and other communication needs. In fact, the public knowledge already recognizes that behind media text production, the pressure continues to build up. The pressure from external forces—for instance from the donors or fund providers—the authorities (especially the government), professionals, other organizations and people.

Moving on, the aim of the study is to achieve the answer for the problem, which include: (1) to have knowledge on the tendencies of profeminism portrayal existence in public service ads on family planning and healthy reproduction, (2) to have knowledge on the public service ads on family planning and healthy reproduction programs process, (3) to have knowledge on institution biasness on gender issues relating to families, (4) to have knowledge on the influence of gender relation happening in the society through the profeminism portrayal within public service ads on family planning and healthy reproduction programs. This matter not only takes effect on image of men acting and participating in family planning and healthy reproduction programs, but also becomes an interesting public discourse in relation to the paradigm shift of family planning that stresses on gender fairness and equality. In a society that is intensely dominated with the patriarchy culture, representing profeminism in the media is not easy. Through framing analysis, how media texts glorify the discourse that has failed to be brought up by society can be shown. The analysis also suppresses or even conceals and eradicates the particular ‘frame’ in which is oppositely highlighted strongly by society.
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Social Construction of Reality Theory

The studies that made women play as their object of observation, mostly found that women all these times have been in a less advantaged position in society. In addition to that, those studies concluded that men mostly achieve the advantages and prerogative rights that continue to live in the patriarchy culture. The gender inequality and discrimination towards women are believed by feminist activists happen in the smallest system, family. Even family cannot run away from state’s intervention in applying development policies. One of the development programs in Indonesia which are opposed by the feminists due to gender bias and are considered to violate the human rights are family planning and healthy reproduction.

Women as the dominating target in family planning and healthy reproduction programs and the low level participation of men in those programs derive from social reality construction in which throughout time has successfully maintain itself in the society’s patriarchy culture. Therefore, a few social theories to act as the theoretical framework were used. One of them is the social theory from Berger and Luckmann (1966) that explained about the process formation of social reality in the form of subjective and objective reality based on members within society’s interaction through dialectic process. The reality being studied is the symbolic reality in media about profeminism.

Profeminism means the support to what is being fought by the feminists, to create fairness and equality in gender. Socialist feminism was used, because it is believed that unfairness and inequality in gender relations are caused by the patriarchy culture and capitalism. Besides that, the analysis from observing families being done by socialist feminism saw that a few aspects from the girls’ lives in a family can be economical, biosocial and ideological. Profesionalism is not only aimed at conducted by women. According to James P. Sterba (Arivia, 1999: 51), “If feminism is good for men, it means that men can be good too for feminism under a few criteria.” The ideal criteria of a man according to Sterba are supporting “gender free” or “androgynous society”. This also means that every individual must be pushed to act non-discriminating to any sex.

To create an androgyous society, there needs to be a persuasive communication where one of them is using a public service ad. In the public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction, an ideal family is commonly pictured with a four member family, and the portrayal of gender relation between the man and woman in that family. The entrance of gender issue in the family planning and healthy reproduction has to be criticized continuously. Is the ad already presenting a support towards the feminist movement, or only preserving the gender bias.

Then in analysing the text of family planning and healthy reproduction program, the intertextuality analysis from Norman Fairclough is put in use as well as the hegemony theory from Gramsci. Based on the Fairclough model of intertextuality analysis concept, it was believed that a text is produced and consumed, followed by relating the social culture practices happening that time. The Gramsci hegemony theory was used because persuasive communication conveyed through the public service ads on family planning and healthy reproduction programs was actually an ideology naming process to the mass in order for them to eliminate the feeling of being forced to do things shown in the ads. In the level of text, an analysis using the Pan and Kosicki model of framing analysis was used, with Arthur Asa Berger picture shoot technique modification. The public service ads are produced by units in BKKBN like the Advocacy Director and KIE, the sub from Media Production Centre and Men Participation Increment Directorate, where the majority of the staffs are male. The media produced were mainly dedicated to and consumed by a husband and wife as well as (pasanganusiasubur). While in social culture practices, information were gathered through LITERATURE work like novels. The reason being is because novels portray how the writers/authors gave the role to the characters based on the current values.

METHOD

According to the constructivism paradigm that bases the study on media text, the analysis object would be about the issue on profeminism portrayal in the public service ads for family planning and
healthy reproduction programs. Therefore, this study is actually more on qualitative study with media discourse analysis.

In constructing this study, the level of text that will be studied is the public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction programs that include in them persuasive communication, on how ideal men and women are being represented. The selection on public service ads was based on a few interests, like the variety of the direction of text, the tendencies of framing alteration from time to time and the representation of the essence in the portrayal of men and women, as well as gender relation between them. The time of texts that would be observed are those ads produced between 1970-2000, which is they would be grouped into each decade.

In the level of story practices, the data were collected by observation and deep interviews with the staffs behind the production of media texts (informant) that were considered to represent the problem of men’s participation in family planning and healthy reproduction programs. In the level of social culture practices, secondary data were used to see the gender relation that was applied at that time. The secondary data were collected from novels, because a novel was ideally produced to convey the condition of social, politics and culture critiques that were happening in society. The critiques on gender relation inequality between men and women also took part in the writer’s observation at the time. After that, the public service ads chosen from all available production, each was analyzed using the approach and method used previously by Pan and Kosicki. The framing analysis from Pan and Kosicki was chosen based on the consideration that each method they conducted was more accurate and wider in analyzing each element from the content of media texts, in which the methods were able to produce many framing device that could be dug from the four analysis structure, which are: syntactic, script, thematic, and rhetorical.

It must be recognized that each instrument used for the process of collecting, information digging, and knowledge researching has its limitation and weaknesses, such as: First, the studies with the constructivism approach often neglect the power or authority element, therefore this study is also lacking in paying attention to the ability of domination in institution and media content. Second, the selection of research object in the form of public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction programs that started from 1970-2000 have weaknesses, in which the ads that successfully gathered and chosen only covered a little portion of the many number of public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction programs produced by BKKBN. Thus, the observation on gender issues in public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction programs might not be whole and less sharp.

Third, to find out about the social culture practices that picture profeminism in the society besides performing story analysis for media texts, the data need to be complemented by conducting deep interviews with the people. As a result, the meaning and value of profeminism in the society cannot be found. Fourth, the weaknesses also come from the portrayal of profeminism in the role of the ideal husband in a family that is too simple. Remembering how complex the values, morals, norms and ethics that are embedded in society regarding a gender role that are each exchanged and accepted as a consensus. The consensus reached have always been practiced without burden, therefore it seemed like there have been nothing wrong with the gender relation from the old times to today. While it is within the consensus hegemony plays its part, the force without any guilt was done through persuasive communication.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

From nine public service advertising on family planning and healthy reproduction among 1970-2000 is chosen for the study, each was grouped based on its decade. The picture on profeminism in media was determined with the criteria where there was portrayal on support of women’s’ rights, like giving equal proportion in depicting the figure or physical appearance, right and obligation between men and women, the use of contraception that is equal on both quantity and quality, as well as the participation of men in family planning and health reproduction programs.

Public Service Advertising

According to the result of the study, the depiction towards the support for gender fairness and equality being fought by feminist activists, are mostly driven for the success of family planning and
healthy reproduction programs. Based on the other findings from the years of 1970s until 2000s, there was a primary theme shift on the family planning and healthy reproduction programs, in which previously it was oriented on limiting the number of children to two, as well as the system of the number of acceptors (1970s and 1980s), to attempting on maintaining the number of acceptors (1990s) and the execution of family planning and healthy reproduction programs that were concerning on human rights and gender equalities (2000s).

Era 1970s  Era 1980s  Era 1990s  Era 2000s

Regarding to pictures above, a summary on data from public service advertising for family planning and healthy reproduction ads chosen from each decade is displayed, which shows the selection of primary themes and sub-themes from each production, portrayal of men and women in a family, gender relation depiction between men and women in a family, portrayal on contraception in family planning and healthy reproduction programs, portrayal on men’s participation in the family planning and healthy reproduction programs.

The Figure of Man and Woman in a Family

On every decade, the figure of a man in a family was generally pictured as the head of household. For the physical appearance, a husband is pictured as a figure with clean cut and good looks. In the public service ads during decade of 1970 all the way until 2000, there have been nine public service ads in which 6 displayed men with moustache. It could mean that the ‘moustache’ is an attribute owned only by men to give the impression of handsome and masculine. In the 1970s, the aggressive behaviours from men were still shown, through explicit attraction with pretty women. It appeared to be a common thing that men showed these aggressive behaviours, even in front of the wife. Moving on to the 1980s until 2000s, the idea that men has to have the biological needs fulfilled and the impact if the needs were not fulfilled, while the wives were demanded to act as the controller. Usually the worries for getting pregnant came from the woman or wife, while there was only small portrayal on worries coming from the husband alone.

In addition, it turned out that from nine public service ads, only three showed the portrayal of boys in a family: two in which positioned the boy as the second child in the family. Only one ad showed both children being girls in a family. This relates to the government efforts in altering society’s perception that within a family, there is no obligation to have a boy, since boys and girls are the same, and boys do not have to be the first child in a family.

The Gender Relation between Man and Woman in a Family

The gender relation portrayed through nine public service ads is still showing inequality in gender biasness. This is shown by the domination in public sphere by male. The angle shows the husband entering the house from outside or scenes where the husband stays outside the house shows that the husband still dominates the jobs and tasks done in the public sphere or external room. Meaning, women in public service ads from the decade of 1970s to 2000s still played the same role, which was actively engaged with the private sphere or domestic work holds. There seemed to be no equal proportion in which many women nowadays have performed routines in the public sphere. Another thing is that a wife is not portrayed as someone with biological needs, appeared to be more passive and tend to be the controller. The offer to have intercourse was usually pictured coming from the husbands, while the wives would just wait.

Even if there was an effort to show that men could be doing domestic jobs done by women, it would only be to the extent of ‘side’ jobs and normally the wife would be seen carrying the child. For
example, in the ad, “Proactive Husband-SuamiSiaga”, where the husband draws water from the well while the wife hangs the clothes she just washed, or the husband carries a water thermos while the wife is carrying the vegetables ready to be cooked. This indicated that there is still selection in roles and chores that are decent to be performed by men or women.

**Portrayal on Man’s Participation in Family Planning and Health Reproduction**

The portrayal of man’s or husband’s participation in the family planning and healthy reproduction program faced very slow changes and shifts. In the decade of 1970s and 1980s, the husband’s participation was still shown by giving support to the wife in using family planning. The husband was seen as the figure who wanted to accompany his wife to get medical checkup in the health Clinique or any other health service institutions. However, the husbands were not seen staying beside the wives when the contraception was applied. Normally, the husbands stayed outside the checkup room or in the waiting room, and leaving the wife having her own medical treatment. The moral support from the husband to the wife seemed sufficiently portrayed by the media. However, the support for fund was never shown. In the “Free Family Planning” ad, where it was played by two comedians, Basuki and CiciTegal, the husbands seemed to worry about the expensive price. The active participation from men or husbands in family planning programs appeared in the 2000s.

In the family planning and healthy reproduction public service ads, the meaning from profeminism was directed towards loyalty and the increasing number of family planning acceptors. With that, distortion for the meaning of profeminism in the family planning and healthy reproduction public service advertising occurred. The distortion on profeminism values appeared from the fact that women’s role in the public sphere was not represented. The role selection was based on gender, like how men were busy with his routines of earning money in the public sphere and women with her routines in managing the house in the private sphere. In the intercourse relationship of the husband and wife, the man mainly acted as the demanding active actor and is aggressive. While the woman was more of a passive actor, controller and chose to only have it if the husband said so because she seemed to have less personal interest in having intercourse. Therefore, it could be implied that values or behaviour guidance between men and women were still strongly influenced by the patriarchy culture.

The portrayal of the man figure in the decade of 1970s, in the public service as ‘Using Family Planning in Koperasi Service Office’, was drawn as someone aggressive and a bit flirtatious, while the woman was portrayed as someone who could accept any sorts of flirtatious attempts made by the spouse to other women. This is not far different from what was mentioned in the novel ‘Cintaku di KampusBiru’ (AshadiSiregar, 1976). The main character is Anton Rorimpandey who was perceived to have good looks and acts like a DonJuan, and has many girlfriends. While in the novel ‘PadaSebuahkapal’ (NH Dini, 1977), the husband from the main character, Sri turned to other woman.

In the decade of the 1980s, the figure of a man was not far from what was portrayed one decade beforehand. In the public service ad blue circle with the version of ‘Ya, ya, ya”, a husband was actively asking the wife to have intercourse, and was always rejected by the wife because she had not get family planning. On another ad, “BinaKeluargaBalita”, there was also an effort to frame the figure of a man who nurtured and educated the children. Although was still considered as passive, and he would only engage if there was demand from the children or wife. Relating to the portrayal of men and women in the 1980s, in the novel, “Burung-BurungManyar” (J.B. Mangunwijaya, 1981), it was told that Atik or Larasati, as the main characters who successfully managed both her career and housewife (double role), whereas in another novel, “PermainanBulanDesember” (Mira W., 1981), it drew a character named Anton who eventually eloped with a nun.

In the public service ads in the 1990s, there seemed to be changes in frame, although not every ad displayed the same thing. For example, in the ad “SuamiSiaga”, there was an effort to show the figure of an ideal man or husband in a family, but the physical appearance and the types of jobs done for the wife while helping her still dominate the patriarchy culture. Other public service ads like ‘DipasangSaja’, showed support for the wife to use family planning, and still conveyed that wives who use family planning would make their husbands happy. The picture was clear, the wife was no longer worrying and the husband was happy because his biological needs were finally fulfilled. In the ad “KB Gratis” is the figure of a man playing with his pet birds while the wife was busy carrying the child. Entering the year of 1990, many novels told such as in the novel “Larung”, by AyuUtami (1996), told a character named Yasmin, a perfectly beautiful woman, who is intelligent, wealthy, religious,
intellectual, a believer in the values of Pancasila, truthful to her husband, eventually cheated on his husband with a man named Saman, who is a former frater. It was due to the fact that Lukas, the husband, kept on committing domestic violence to Yasmin. Besides that, Tommy Awuy (1997) in his novel “LogikaFalus” (logical desires), told a story about two men fighting until injured because a woman singer they both wanted was taken by some caucasion man. This was a common logic of men in solving just about anything like through war, some logic filled with lust.

Entering the early decade of 2000s, the frame shaped on men faced a slight change. For example, in the two public service advertising, which are “TanggungJawabPriadalam KB” and “PeranPriadalam KB”, suggestion for husbands to participate in family planning arose, although both never showed the idea of men taking the role in domestic jobs, but instead showed men working as the income earner and the activity of safeguarding at night. While women were still portrayed as the figure performing domestic roles, which came out from inside the house and being in the medical check-up room alone. In the novel, Dewi Lestari (2000) titled “Supernova: Ksatria, Putri, danBintangJatuh”, the will of women to show resistance from restricting values within a family was shown. But this novel not only gave alternatives to solve the problem, but even reintroduced the sexual function in the normative values out there. From the existence of second chances, it was intended that man and woman could both have better comprehension about what eachother wants.

**CONCLUSION**

The physical portrayal of men and women, and the division of roles between them according to their gender differences, are very limited indicators of profeminism. The minim profeminism—both quantity and quality signals that the support towards feminism movement is only artificial in nature. Quantitatively, the portrayal that men and women can do the same jobs is so small. Quantitatively, men were commonly pictured helping only and never replacing the wives in doing their jobs.

The production process in public service ads for Family Planning and Healthy Reproduction programs in which previously was centralized is now being produced by many regions throughout the nation. However, the content of the ads needs to be aligning with the national program as a whole. The primary theme from the nine public service ads for Family Planning and Healthy Reproduction programs was generally focused on the effort to create a small, happy and prosperous family. The ideal number of two children in a family was constantly being sent across, and even throughout the ads in the decade of 2000s. The attempt to alter the opinion that “boys and girls are the same” eventually stopped until the decade of 1980s.

The gender relations applied in the society influence the profeminism within the public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction. The domination of patriarchy culture in the society appeared also in the public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction. The masculinity on men and feminisim on women initiated when the people behind the text production expressed them in those ads. Consideration of target audience, who would be exposed to the message, is one of the reasons why the gender bias in the society with intense patriarchy culture still dominates the public service ads for family planning and healthy reproduction.

The research in this thesis is the beginning for the next studies in digging the closeness of media construction and the people’s reconstruction towards a particular fact. Therefore, the next study better pay attention to other approaches and theories to provide contributions in determining the closeness between semi reality and actual reality. Symbolic reality can also be studied from critical approach stressing on the domination of media/institution and people’s resistance through counter hegemony as an alternative ideology. There needs to be efforts to disassemble and reconstruct the fact that even men can do the same jobs women are doing in the private sphere. Vice versa, women can also take part in the public. Thus, the potential for fairness and equality in gender expected can soon be achieved. Third, a deep interview with the wide public should happen. This is important to dig and gain the data regarding social culture practices, especially about the gender relations in every day’s life as the portrayal of profeminism in society. So then it would enrich the data findings and minimize the potential for flaws in drawing a conclusion.
REFERENCES


